# WHO MAKES THE NEWS? 

## GMMP

Global Media Monitoring Project

MACAU SAR
(PRC)
REPORT


## GMMP

## Global Media <br> Monitoring <br> Project

2020

## ccreative <br> commons

GMMP 2020 is licensed under creativecommons using an Attribution－NonCommercial－NoDerivs．

GMMP 2020 is co－ordinated by the World Association for Christian Communication （WACC），an international NGO which promotes communication for social change，．


Data for GMMP 2020 were collectedthrough the collective voluntary effort of hundreds of organizations including gender and media activists，grassroots communication groups， university researchers，students，media professionals，journalists associations， alternative media networks and faith groups． Noncommercial．You may not use this workfor commercial purposes．
No derivative Works．You may not alter， transform，or build upon this work． For any use or distribution，you must make clear to others the license terms of this work．Your fair use and other rights are in no way affected by the above

aipim
em Português e Inglês de Macau
Macau Portuguese and English Press Association
澳 門 葡 英 傳 媒 協 會


Australian
Austrabian
Broadcasting
Corporation

Macau is a Special Administrative Region of People＇s Republic of China．For the purposes of this project and to follow its pre－determined structure，Macau is presented in an individual report．

## Acknowledgements

I would like to thank the volunteers who participated in GMMP 2020 in Macau. Their hard work and the possibility to discuss the methods of analysis with them was crucial for the completion of this project in Macau. Their names are included in Annex 2.

## Maria Salomé Fernandes

Coordinator, Macau SAR (PRC), GMMP 2020

Table of contents
PREFACE ..... 2
Global Context ..... 2
Macau Local Context ..... 3
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY ..... 4
A DAY IN THE NEWS IN MACAU ..... 6
THE CONTEXT ..... 6
TOPICS IN THE NEWS ..... 7
NEWS SUBJECTS AND SOURCES ..... 9
JOURNALISTS AND REPORTERS ..... 12
JOURNALISTIC PRACTICE: ON WOMEN’S CENTRALITY, GENDER STEREOTYPES AND RIGHTS-BASED REPORTING ..... 14
FOCUS ON COVID-19 NEWS ..... 15
DIGITAL NEWS ON WEBSITES ..... 15
CASE STUDIES ..... 17
SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS ..... 23
RECOMMENDATIONS AND ACTION PLAN 2021-2025 ..... 24
BIBLIOGRAPHY ..... 24
Annex 1. Methodology ..... 25
Annex 2. List of Monitors ..... 28

## THE WORLD AT A GLANCE GENDER GAP IN SUBJECTS, SOURCES AND REPORTERS IN THE NEWS.



Figure 1. Gender Gap: News Subjects \& Sources. Newspaper, radio and television news.
Data source: Global Media Monitoring Project, 2020


Figure 2. Gender gap: Reporters in the stories. Newspaper, radio and television news.
Data source: Global Media Monitoring Project, 2020

## PREFACE

## Global Context

The Global Media Monitoring Project (GMMP) is the world's longest-running and most extensive research on gender in the news media. The research was designed to capture a snapshot of gender on one 'ordinary' news day in the world news media. An ordinary news day is defined as one in which the news agenda contains the run-of-the-mill mix of stories, everyday articles on politics, economy, social issues, crime, and other issues.

It began in 1995 when volunteers in 71 countries around the world monitored women's presence in their national radio, television, and print news. The media monitoring has been repeated every five years since then, taking stock of change in the gender dimensions of news media content and collecting statistical data on new indicators.

The 1995 research revealed that only $17 \%$ of news subjects - the people who are interviewed or whom the news are about - were women. It found that gender parity was 'a distant prospect in any region of the world. News [were] more often being presented by women but [they were] still rarely about women. 1

The first noteworthy change in women's overall presence in the news was registered in 2005 in the third iteration of the research. 2 Women comprised $21 \%$ of news subjects, a three-percentage point increase over the period 2000 to 2005. Their near invisibility continued however, with only $10 \%$ of stories focusing centrally on women, underrepresentation in the major news topics and as voices in the news.

By the fifth GMMP in 2015, it was clear that "ordinary" news days could not be predicted or planned: unexpected events take place that dominate the news, from the Kobe earthquake in 1995, to the Germanwings plane crash in the Alps in 2015.

The 2015 research in 114 countries revealed continued severe gender disparities in news media content. Findings on key indicators suggested that progress towards gender equality had lost traction; women remained only $24 \%$ of the persons heard, read about, or seen in newspaper, television, and radio news, exactly the same level found in the fourth wave of the research in 2010. Three editions of the research - in 2005, 2010 and 2015 found no change on the indicator measuring women's participation in the news as reporters; only $37 \%$ of stories in legacy media were reported by women.

Women's relative invisibility in traditional news media had also crossed over into the digital news delivery platforms included in the GMMP monitoring for the first time. Only $26 \%$ of the people in stories on mainstream news websites and media news Tweets combined were women. The challenges of news media sexism, gender stereotyping and gender bias were apparently intractable across time, space, and content delivery platforms.

UN Under-Secretary-General and UN Women Executive Director Phumzile MlamboNgcuka underlined that the ways in which women are depicted in the media "have a

[^0]profound effect on societal attitudes and reinforce traditional gender roles. Women and girls are half of humanity. Giving equal time and weight to their stories, featuring them as positive models not victims, plays an under-appreciated part in creating a better, freer world for all of us." 3

Events during the 2020 GMMP year were even more extraordinary; beginning in late 2019 and intensifying during the year, the world was ravaged by the novel coronavirus Covid-19. This sixth wave of the research offered an opportunity to scrutinize gender in media coverage during a global catastrophe, a time marked by a worldwide health crisis, and the intensified inequalities accompanying the crisis.

GMMP teams in 116 countries monitored 30172 stories published in newspapers, broadcast on radio and television, and disseminated on news websites and via news media tweets in 2251 outlets. The stories contained 58,499 news subjects and sources and were reported and presented by 28,595 journalists. The number of participating nations increased by $63 \%$ since 1995 as baseline data were collected for eight countries joining the study for the first time. The number of news items monitored has doubled over the past 25 years and risen by over 8,000 since the 2015 edition.

Findings from the sixth GMMP reveal a mixed picture of progress, stagnation, and regression. While some glass ceilings are clearly being edged upwards, others are setting in on certain important news media gender equality indicators. The past five years have seen small incremental changes towards parity, at the same time, the overall pace of change remains glacial.

## Macau Local Context

- Macau Basic Law states that all Macau residents are equal before the law, and cannot be discriminated on the grounds of sex.
- In 2005, the Government of Macau SAR created the "Consultative Commission for Women's Affairs", in order for women to "fully assert their rights in different areas", including economic and political. However, this organism suffered alterations over the years. In 2016, Government created the "Commission for Women and Child Affairs", after deciding to include matters pertaining to children in the commission. ${ }^{4}$
- The planning of "Macau Women Development Goals" (2019-2025) defines the "promotion of a higher participation of women in the scope of media and culture" as a goal. ${ }^{5}$ The plan involved encouraging media organizations to create administrative guidelines to promote participation under the principle of gender equality, as well as for media and cultural organizations to promote the appointment of women to leadership positions.

[^1]- Data from 2016, from the Social Welfare Bureau ${ }^{6}$ indicates that the gender gap index in Macau was 0.718 , and gender inequality was classified with 0.067 . Within media, data from 2006 indicated that management level staff in companies in the media sectors were mainly occupied by men ( 7 women and 30 men ). At the time, the number of female journalists was going up, reaching 102, but they were still outnumbered by men, who were $68,7 \%$ of the workforce.
- The median monthly income of women who are residents was 18.500 patacas in 2020 (whereas the median for men was 20.000 ), but the median for the general working population is lower. There are significant differences between resident and non-resident workers. The way women are portrayed in media depending on their background and social status could prove an interesting point for further research.
- In a report regarding the status of women in Macau 2017, results show that women still have to do the house shores and that working women aimed for family-career balance; that the income of working women increased but they still faced obstacles for career development; as well as that there is room for an increase in their participation in politics. ${ }^{7}$
- According to a survey on information technology usage in the household sector 2020, more than 290 thousand people used the internet to read or download newspapers and magazines, which is the equivalent to around $51,3 \%$ of the total 566.300 internet users in Macau ${ }^{8}$.
- This was the first year Macau participated in the GMMP, therefore there is no historical data for a comparison of results.


## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

## People in the news

In 2020, women constituted only $29 \%$ of the people heard, read about or seen in newspaper, television and radio news. The gender gap is narrowest in stories on science and health, which was the third major news topic in traditional media. Women make up $40 \%$ of the people in news under this topic, in contrast to only $19 \%$ in political or economy news stories.

Women's relative invisibility in traditional news media is similar in digital news platforms: only $35 \%$ of the people in Internet news stories are women.

[^2]Across the six GMMP functions (or roles) in which people appear in the news, the more balanced is as "eye witnesses", of which women comprised half. The gender gap is wider in people interviewed for their "personal experience" ( $68 \%$ women) and "expert or commentator" (13\% women).

## Reporters and presenters

In the 2020, the proportion of women reporters was above $60 \%$ in all media except for print although the sex of more than half of the journalists in print media was not known. Male television presenters ( $91 \%$ ) outnumber their female colleagues, whereas in radio female presenters (56\%) are the majority.

Although female reporters have a higher tendency to report on stories with women as central focus, the source selection did not present a significant difference: female reporters chose women as news subjects $54 \%$ of times, and male reporters as often as $46 \%$.

## Journalistic practice

Only $9 \%$ of news stories highlighted issues of gender equality or inequality, legislation or policy. Social and legal stories make the highest contribution (24\%) to the average of stories referencing the frameworks, followed by stories on politics and government (17\%).

Stories with a central focus on women comprised only $7 \%$ in total, most of them related to crime and violence.

## Covid-19 news

In a year marked by a global pandemic, television was the medium with higher coverage of Covid-19 stories ( $38 \%$ ), followed closely by internet, radio and then print. More than half of these stories were covered by women.

GMMP 2020 Macau shows that "science and health" news associated to the pandemic had more women as experts/commentators and spokesperson than the general proportion.

## Digital news

Economy stories had the highest online presence, with a total of 14 news of which $79 \%$ were not shared on Facebook.

Overall, $7 \%$ of internet news made reference to gender equality or HR policies. However, only $2 \%$ of news clearly challenge stereotypes. From the people who are in the news, when it comes to the internet men are more visible in all functions.

## A DAY IN THE NEWS IN MACAU

29 September 2020 - No unusual or dramatic event took place that made the news day atypical. The main stories were related to Macau's infection prevention measures against Covid-19 for the holiday period that was ahead. A fraud case involving the Education Bureau also attracted media attention, however, since it was only made public on the $29^{\text {th }}$, newspapers published on that date did not have that information yet.

Table 1. Top major news topics in traditional media on the global monitoring day

## RANK TOPIC DESCRIPTION

| $\mathbf{1}$ | Social and Legal |
| :--- | :--- |
| $\mathbf{2}$ | Politics and Government |
| $\mathbf{3}$ | Science and Health |
| $\mathbf{4}$ | Economy |
| $\mathbf{5}$ | Crime and Violence |
| $\mathbf{6}$ | Celebrity, Arts and Media, |
|  | Sports |

Amongst the most common detailed topics within all media that day were the "environment, pollution, tourism", the "legal system, judicial system, legislation", "medicine, health, hygiene, safety, disability, medical research, funding" as well as "economic policies, strategies, modules, indicators, stock markets, taxes".

## THE CONTEXT

Macau is a Special Administrative Region of the People's Republic of China, with Chinese and Portuguese as its official languages. Although Macau has several Chinese daily newspapers, only one Chinese language newspaper was chosen due to a lack of bilingual volunteers. Taking into consideration a higher level of diversity, English language newspapers were also chosen for monitorization.

Table 2. Media monitored

| Medium |  |  |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Newspaper (6) | Radio (2) | Television (3) | Internet (5) |
| Jornal Tribuna de Macau | TDM (Chinese <br> department) | TDM (Chinese <br> department) | TDM Radio <br> (Chinese <br> department) |
| Hoje Macau | TDM (Portuguese <br> department) | TDM (Portuguese <br> department) | TDM Radio <br> (Portuguese <br> department) |
| Ponto Final |  | MASTV Company <br> Limited | MASTV Company <br> Limited |
| Macau Daily Times |  |  | Hoje Macau |
| The Macau Post Daily |  |  | Exmoo News |
| Ou Mun Iat Pou |  |  |  |

Monitoring team: In total, the monitoring team was comprised by nine people, including the coordinator. Given the vast majority of the team were journalists, work had to be divided to make sure no one was coding news from their own workplace, to avoid conflicts of interest. We coded a total of 180 news stories over four media (newspaper, radio, television and internet) and coded 262 sources and 185 announcers and reporters.

## TOPICS IN THE NEWS

A total of 180 news stories across newspapers, radio, TV and online platforms were coded. A certain degree of consistency is visible in traditional media, namely in radio and television, since both registered a high proportion of news related to "Economy" and "Science and Health". Although $30 \%$ of print news regarded these topics, others still stood out more. "Politics and Government" dominated print news (28\%), followed by "Social and Legal" affairs ( $26 \%$ ). Topics linked to "Gender \& related" and "Celebrity, Arts and Media, Sports" have received less attention, specially from traditional media.

Regarding the internet, around a third of the news focused on "Economy". Moreover, a spike in news about "Crime and Violence" is noticeable in online platforms.

The analysis bellow shows the differences in the distribution of stories across the media landscape. It is worth noting that the majority of internet sites included were the digital platforms of the traditional media monitored. However, to avoid double coding, the news that were covered exactly in the same way were not coded.

## Figure 1. Presence of different topics in the news



It is also noticeable that the context of the pandemic was reflected on the news, with $31 \%$ of all stories amongst the four media being connected to Covid-19.

Figure 2. Stories related to Covid-19


Figure 2.1. Stories related to Covid-19, by topic


## NEWS SUBJECTS AND SOURCES

This sector analyses the presence of women and men in the news. A total of 253 news subjects were coded: 201 in traditional media (print, radio and television), and 52 in internet. Results show that women only represent $29 \%$ of news subjects in traditional media, and $35 \%$ in internet. Moreover, disaggregated data reveals that women represent $24 \%$ of news sources in print, $29 \%$ in radio, $44 \%$ in television, and $35 \%$ in internet.

Women's presence in traditional media is higher in "science and health" (reaching 40\%), followed by "social and legal" ( $33 \%$ ) and "crime and violence" $(30 \%)$. Both in "politics and government" and "economy", the percentage of female news subjects drops to $19 \%$. As table 3 shows, internet is more balanced in news related to "economy" and "social and legal" affairs, with women receiving equal attention to men: women's presence reaches $50 \%$. While there is no online presence of women in news related to politics or gender, it should be noted that in these topics only 3 news subjects were registered in total.

Comparing to traditional media in Asia, women's presence in media is 3 points below in the field of "economy" and "celebrity, arts and media, sports", and 45 points lower in "gender". On the other side, it stands out that Macau presents 15 more points than the region's average in scientific and health matters, and 8 more in the "social and legal" topic. Moreover, Macau shows a much higher proportion of women in the news in online media in "economy", and "social and legal" topics.

Figure 3. Overall presence of women in news


The majority of people appearing in the news telling their personal experience were women ( $68 \%$ ), and half of eye witnesses were women. However, women were underrepresented as experts or commentators, spokespeople and subjects in the news, as Figure 4 shows.

Overall, more women are identified by their family status in the news ( $9 \%$ ) when compared to men (only $1 \%$ ), and only women reporters have identified news subjects by family status. Among people who are represented in the news, men are more quoted $-67 \%$ of all men and $53 \%$ of all women are directly quoted.

Figure 4. Women's function in news stories


A total of 28 occupations and broad groups were considered, including the miscellaneous category of "other" and "not stated". In terms of percentage, there were four categories in which women comprised more than $50 \%$ of the groups, the majority of them with a low number of news sources, as shown below in Table 3.

As we can observe in the table, women comprised $17 \%$ of the group including politicians and members of parliament, the largest occupational identified, representing almost $20,9 \%$ of all sources. The other two most popular source occupations were "business person, exec, manager, stock broker", where women comprised $21 \%$ of the category, followed by "government employee, public servant, spokesperson", in which women constituted $48 \%$ of sources.

The table demonstrates that women's voices are significantly underrepresented, for example, in professions linked to politics, justice, economy and security forces. On the other hand, women are over-represented as non-management workers and members of the general public (homemaker/parent, villager/resident).

Table 3. Position or occupation of news sources

| Occupation | Women \% <br> in sources | Total <br> Number |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Not stated | $58 \%$ | 12 |
| Royalty, monarch, deposed monarch, etc. | $0 \%$ | 0 |
| Politician/ member of parliament... | $17 \%$ | 42 |
| Government employee, public servant, spokesperson, etc. | $48 \%$ | 23 |
| Police, military, para-military, militia, fire officer | $7 \%$ | 14 |
| Academic expert, lecturer, teacher | $25 \%$ | 4 |
| Doctor, dentist, health specialist | $31 \%$ | 13 |
| Health worker, social worker, childcare worker | $0 \%$ | 0 |
| Science/ technology professional, engineer, etc. | $0 \%$ | 0 |
| Media professional, journalist, film-maker, etc. | $0 \%$ | 0 |
| Lawyer, judge, magistrate, legal advocate, etc. | $13 \%$ | 8 |
| Business person, exec, manager, stock broker... | $21 \%$ | 24 |
| Office or service worker, non-management worker | $100 \%$ | 1 |
| Tradesperson, artisan, labourer, truck driver, etc. | $0 \%$ | 1 |
| Agriculture, mining, fishing, forestry | $0 \%$ | 0 |
| Religious figure, priest, monk, rabbi, mullah, nun | $0 \%$ | 6 |
| Activist or worker in civil society org., NGO, trade union | $27 \%$ | 11 |
| Sex worker | $0 \%$ | 0 |
| Celebrity, artist, actor, writer, singer, TV personality | $33 \%$ | 12 |
| Sportsperson, athlete, player, coach, referee | $0 \%$ | 0 |
| Student, pupil, schoolchild | $33 \%$ | 6 |
| Homemaker, parent | $100 \%$ | 4 |
| Child, young person no other occupation given | $0 \%$ | 0 |
| Villager or resident no other occupation given | $100 \%$ | 2 |
| Retired person, pensioner no other occupation given | $0 \%$ | 1 |
| Criminal, suspect no other occupation given | $14 \%$ | 7 |
| Unemployed no other occupation given | $0 \%$ | 0 |
| Other | $40 \%$ | 10 |
|  |  |  |

## JOURNALISTS AND REPORTERS

Besides the main topics of news and who is included in them, it was also assessed who reported the news. A total of 185 reporters were analyzed: 66 from print news, 34 from radio, 42 in television and 43 from online stories. Regarding the gender of reporters, announcers and presenters in media, results point out that $44 \%$ in print, $62 \%$ in radio and $33 \%$ in television were women.

Figure 5. Reporters, announcers and presenters in different media, by sex


The proportion of women reporters is above $60 \%$ in all media except for print. But it should be noted that in more than half of the print journalists their sex was not known (14 women, 18 men and 34 classified as "don't know"). However, there are wide variations between their participation in media and their roles. If women seem to have a strong presence in media work force, their professional role seems to be disproportionate. This was especially noticeable in television, where $60 \%$ of reporters were women, but men represented $91 \%$ of presenters.

Figure 6. Reporters by medium, by sex


Figure 7. Female and male presenters in Radio and Television


There were differences regarding the story focus of stories covered by men and women. Within the group of male reporters, there was a relatively even spread across topics of politics/government ( $18 \%$ ), social/legal ( $18 \%$ ), science and health ( $25 \%$ ) and economy ( $29 \%$ ). However, coverage of crime/violence drops to $4 \%$. On the other side, women's frequency covering crime/violence news was $18 \%$, and their focus on politics/government was as low as $6 \%$.

The selection of sources was relatively balanced, with female reporters choosing women as news subjects $54 \%$ of times, and male reporters as often as $46 \%$. Nonetheless, results show that female reporters have a higher tendency to report on stories with women as central focus. Yet, only $12 \%$ of their stories have that focus, with $7 \%$ of men reporters' news focusing on women.

## JOURNALISTIC PRACTICE: ON WOMEN'S CENTRALITY, GENDER STEREOTYPES AND RIGHTS-BASED REPORTING

Overall, only $9 \%$ of news stories highlighted issues of gender equality or inequality, legislation or policy, all of them associated with political and social/legal topics. Women reporters were no more likely to write stories on gender equality than male colleagues. Only $6 \%$ of women stories and 5\% of male reporters involved references to it.

There were very few stories with a central focus on women (7\%), and of these, the story types most likely to have this approach were crime and violence (23\%), social and legal ( $15 \%$ ) and celebrity/arts/media/sport (13\%). All stories that clearly challenged gender stereotypes were reported by women journalists. However, those represented only $15 \%$ (3 out of 20) of all stories by women, revealing that a critical approach that helps dismantle unhelpful caricatures of the characteristics and roles of women and men based on their gender is largely absent in local mainstream journalism .

Figure 8. References to issues of gender equality, legislation or policy by topic


## FOCUS ON COVID-19 NEWS

Almost a third of all stories were related to Covid-19. Television was the medium with higher coverage of these stories ( $38 \%$ ), followed by internet (35\%), radio (32\%) and then print ( $26 \%$ ).

The majority of Covid-19 related stories (59\%) was covered by female reporters. Gender stereotypes were found in $5 \%$ of these news, namely on "economy" and "science and health" topics. On the opposite side, only $4 \%$ of covid-19 related stories highlighted gender inequalities: $14 \%$ associated with "social and health" and $17 \%$ with "politics and government" topics. It is worth noting that $4 \%$ is less than half of the overall proportion of stories referencing gender inequality.

Stories on politics with a focus on Covid-19 only had men as subjects, meaning they gave less space to women than news in general, but presented $50 \%$ female spokesperson. Regarding economy, there was only one expert/commentator and two eye witnesses - all of whom were men - and amongst five people presenting personal experiences, only one was a woman ( $20 \%$ ). The data shows more balance regarding spokespeople, with $42 \%$ out of 12 being women, which is higher than the general proportion.

On the topic of "science and health", the same female and male subjects of news were registered, and women sharing their personal experience outnumbered men. However, $67 \%$ of experts/commentators and $60 \%$ of spokesperson were men. Despite the differences, these numbers show that "science and health" news related to the pandemic had more women as experts/commentators and spokesperson than the general proportion.

Data about social and legal news with a focus on Covid-19 shows more unbalanced representation of gender: $80 \%$ out of 5 of spokesperson and $100 \%$ out of 3 commentators/experts were male, whereas $100 \%$ out of 3 people telling their personal experience were women. It is also worth noting that no news subjects or sources were identified as transgender, for example.

## DIGITAL NEWS ON WEBSITES

The table below shows whether stories published on the internet were shared on Facebook. No "Politics and Government" stories were shared, and all "gender \& related" news were shared on this social network, but the percentages can be deceiving since each of these topics only had one news story taken into consideration.
"Economy" was the topic with more online stories, with a total of 14 news of which $79 \%$ were not shared on Facebook. "Crime and violence" stories and "gender \& related" news were more often shared on this social network, with a frequency of $73 \%$ and $100 \%$, respectively. Moreover, half of "social and legal" news were shared. In the rest of the topics, the majority of times online news were not shared on Facebook.

Figure 9. Stories shared on social media Facebook, by topic


Overall, only $7 \%$ of internet news made reference to gender equality or HR policies. All of these were linked to the topics of economy, social and legal, as well as crime and violence.

Online, men are given more voice than women in all capacities. Only a quarter of personal experiences shared and $30 \%$ of subjects in the news were women. And they never appear as experts or commentator - although only one news subject was registered in that function. It is in the function of spokesperson that women appear more often ( $43 \%$ out of 23). In Internet's scope, men are more often identified by their family status ( $9 \%$ ) than women ( $6 \%$ ).

Figure 10. Functions of news subjects


According to the data collected regarding news on the Internet, male reporters never selected women as news subjects. Only female reporters did so, and less than $30 \%$ of the news subjects comprised women. Among people represented in online news, both men and women are directly quoted around a fifth of the times.

Although 7\% of stories raise issues of gender equality/inequality, merely $2 \%$ clearly challenge stereotypes. Moreover, women are a central focus of news only $7 \%$ of times in economy stories and $25 \%$ in social and legal affairs' news.

## CASE STUDIES

No blatant stereotypes were found during the Macau GMMP 2020, which is a positive sign. Below is an analysis of some news which were considered as challenging stereotypes, missing an opportunity, being gender blind or presenting subtle stereotypes.

## Case 1

## MEDIA PUBLIC ACCOUNTABILITY SCORECARD

Professionalism (Story is fair, accurate and balanced from a gender equality perspective) - Good (4 points)

Rights-based approach (Story clearly highlights the human and/or women's rights dimensions of the issue) - Good (4 points)

Respect for Freedom of Expression (Story contains the views, perspectives and concerns of women as well as men, told in their own voices) - Poor (1 point)

Total Points: 9
Grade: B - Good

Title: Japan Airlines embraces gender neutral greetings
Published in Print, in The Macau Post Daily

## Summary

The story is about the first airline in Japan to scrap the expression "ladies and gentleman" and adopt genderneutral greetings, as a commitment to tackle gender-based discrimination. It has also pays attention to context on how LGBTQ population in Japan has campaigned for greater recognition from the Government.

Analysis
The main topic is clear in the headline. The focus on an issue such as gender-neutral greetings raises attention to how certain expressions can perpetuate the exclusion of people - which in this case goes beyond conveying how it affects men and women, representing instead a commitment not to discriminate based on gender at all. Therefore, it is considered that this story challenges stereotypes.

## Japan Airlines embraces gender neutral greetings

TOKYO = Japan Airlines is and "good evening" a spokesperson Holdings telling AFP they would "LGBT Ally Charter" flight for from the government in recent years.

## Case 2

## MEDIA PUBLIC ACCOUNTABILITY SCORECARD

Professionalism (Story is fair, accurate and balanced from a gender equality perspective) - Good (4 points)

Rights-based approach (Story clearly highlights the human and/or women's rights dimensions of the issue) - Fair (3 points)

Respect for Freedom of Expression (Story contains the views, perspectives and concerns of women as well as men, told in their own voices) - Poor (1 point)

Total Points: 8
Grade: C - Fair

Topic: Interview - ARTFEM,
Women Artists 2nd International
Biennial of Macau, Carlos
Marreiros
Segment in television newscast in the Portuguese department of TDM

## Summary

This interview is about ARTFEM, a women's artists biennial of Macau, which usually happens in international women's day, but had to be postponed for a few months in 2020 due to Covid-19.

Analysis
The story was integrated in the newscast as a short interview, conducted by the anchor, with one of the curators of the exhibition. It is important to notice that the curator highlights how women are only represented at a $2 \%$ level in museums around the world, which calls attention to their lack of visibility in the field. However, the anchor does not take the opportunity to further analyze the matter. So although this artistic exhibition gives women's work more visibility, the way the interview was conducted failed to approach the reasons behind women's underrepresentation.
Even though this is an exhibition to show women's art pieces, TDM invited only one of the curators, which is a man. Given that there were four curators, two women and two men, we think this was a missed opportunity to hear a feminine voice about the exhibition.

## Case 3

## MEDIA PUBLIC ACCOUNTABILITY SCORECARD

Professionalism (Story is fair, accurate and balanced from a gender equality perspective) - Fair (3 points)

Rights-based approach (Story clearly highlights the human and/or women's rights dimensions of the issue) - Weak (1 points)

Respect for Freedom of Expression (Story contains the views, perspectives and concerns of women as well as men, told in their own voices) - Poor (1 point)

Total Points: 5
Grade: D - Weak

## Analysis

The journalist presents a conclusion and the opinions of the main Macanese associations leaders. However, the journalist opted to gather inputs of male opinions, instead of trying to get as well a perspective from a female representative of the community. The way that the article was conducted can also be based on the fact that both referred associations are led by men, which would make one consider a more profound

Title: Braço de Ferro
Published in Print, in Hoje Macau

## Summary

This article is about a book dedicated to the Macanese community called "The Macanese Chronicles: A History of LusoAsians in a Global Economy".
 analysis of the Macanese communities' reality and concluding that, actually, there is a lack of female voices in this matter.

## MEDIA PUBLIC ACCOUNTABILITY SCORECARD

Professionalism (Story is fair, accurate and balanced from a gender equality perspective) - Fair (3 points)

Rights-based approach (Story clearly highlights the human and/or women's rights dimensions of the issue) - Weak (1 points)

Respect for Freedom of Expression (Story contains the views, perspectives and concerns of women as well as men, told in their own voices) - Poor (1 point)

Total Points: 5
Grade: D - Weak

Title: Government raises NAT quota to 19,000 per day Segment in television newscast in the Chinese department of TDM

Summary
This story reports on the rise of the quota for nucleic acid testing (NAT) to 19,000 per day, even though, some of citizens couldn't make appointment on the day they wanted.

Analysis
This story was considered as a missed opportunity. The anchor gave an example of one student whose gender was not given, but in the visual image, it shows clearly the student is female. The second interviewee said that she did the test just for visiting family, although the family role was not given. A third woman only said the appointment of test was easy, with no personal information being mentioned.
All three interviewees are female, so the selection of interviewees was not balanced. The images show that there were also men in line to access the services, which means the journalist could have tried to get a male perspective as well, since it is a matter that affect both men and women.

## Case 5

## MEDIA PUBLIC ACCOUNTABILITY SCORECARD

Professionalism (Story is fair, accurate and balanced from a gender equality perspective) - Weak (2 points)

Rights-based approach (Story clearly highlights the human and/or women's rights dimensions of the issue) - Weak (1 points)

Respect for Freedom of Expression (Story contains the views, perspectives and concerns of women as well as men, told in their own voices) - Fair (3 points)

Total Points: 6
Grade: D - Weak

Topic: Increase in vacancies for acid nucleic tests
Story broadcasted in the Chinese department of TDM Radio

## Summary

This story/feature from radio portraits the impact of the increase in vacancies for acid nucleic tests in the population, in the context of the pandemic. Moreover, the news links the increase in testes to the Golden Week and the Moon Festival - with the dominant tone of the story on how the interviewed citizens value such policy due to its timing.

## Analysis

To reflect upon the feelings of the population regarding the new policy, a journalist visited two locations for taking the acid nucleic test: Macau Forum and Kiang Wu Hospital. The main stage of the interviews was at Macau Forum, where the journalist interviewed three people. At Kiang Wu Hospital only one was interviewed. Either by coincidence or the journalist's choice, at the main stage, the journalist spoke with three women and no man.
The first interviewed citizen, when speaking about the reason to take an acid nucleic test explained it was to be able to go back to her homeland to visit family, and mentioned her husband. After that, she described how quick the test process was and that she waited too long to be able to take it. When questioned by the journalist "how many people are going back?" the citizen reveals her role as mother, stating that her children are not going back.
At first look, these statements do not seem inadequate, reflecting on the state of life of an ordinary citizen and her search for travelling and therefore taking the acid nucleic test. However, the women interviewed afterward did not show diversity of opinion. Instead, all three interviewees follow the same discourse. In other words, the other two citizens are also mothers who need to take on the task of takings their small children back to the hometown during the public holidays. However, taking acid nucleic tests and going back to hometown is a common need, not a special demand for women, mothers or children. Hence, we can see here signs of subtle gender stereotypes.
In the description presenting the second interviewee, the journalist starts by portraying the reason for the citizen to want to do the test: "with the alleviation of the pandemic, she always wanted to take her daughter back to the homeland". Her role in relation to her daughter continued to stand out, since afterwards the journalist asked about getting a vacancy but also added an extra question "is the child going?". This question contributes to reinforcing the role of women as mothers and care takers.
After interviewing two women in very similar situations, the journalist decides once again to talk to a women with the same role. When the third interviewee appears, the description presenting her does not mention the vacancies for tests, but directly states that "Citizen Tseng said that even if there are public holidays, for now she does not plan to take the children
travelling outside. She predicted an increase of visitants to Macau in the context of the two public holidays. As such, she will try to lower the frequency of taking the children outside". Indirectly, this summary shows not only is she not taking her children to do acid nucleic tests, but also that her family role involves taking care of the children. It is also noticeable that no man was interviewed. The same questions regarding the need to take their children to take the tests, or to take them back to the homeland during the public holidays could have been posed to male citizens.
In the end of the story, which adds information about a different test location - Hospital Kiang Wu - the journalist interviews a man. However, his statements have a different essence from the previous ones. The dialogue he had with the journalist is not mentioned, neither his context for taking the test. The story portrayed the women interviewed as mothers taking responsibilities over their children, while the image of the man is different from that.
Given that the story is about matters related to public health, it could include concerns and needs from citizens with different backgrounds. For instance, there could be more balance regarding the gender of people that were interviewed, for example two women and two men. Their age range could also be more diversified. These options could prevent the reinforcement of gender stereotypes, such as the role of women as mothers.

## SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

Women are more likely to appear in science and health stories in traditional media. This phenomenon extends to online news, where women are also as likely to appear in news related to economy. In general, women appear in internet stories more often ( $35 \%$ ) than in print, radio and television ( $29 \%$ ), showing that the situation is not much better in new media, where women continue to be a minority despite being more than half of the population. ${ }^{9}$

Regarding their function in news stories, they are more likely to be asked to speak about their personal experience (68\%) in relation to a story than for any other reason, such as eye witness (50\%), spokesperson (27\%), being the subject (22\%) or expert/commentator (13\%).

Women are more likely to be identified by their family status, than men. The results show that women are over-represented as non-management workers and members of the general public (homemaker/parent, villager/resident), while underrepresented in occupations linked to politics, justice, economy and security forces.

Only $7 \%$ of stories had a central focus on women, and overall, only $9 \%$ of news stories highlighted issues of gender equality or inequality, legislation or policy, all of them associated with political and social/legal topics. Therefore, gender issues are not a priority amongst media professionals.

The underrepresentation of women's voice in the media occurs even though a large proportion of working journalists are women. The proportion of female reporters is above $60 \%$ in all media except for print. However, variations between their participation in media and their roles was noticeable, particularly in television, where men represented $91 \%$ of presenters.

Understanding how women are portrayed in the media is also important considering that Macau SAR Government set development goals that include a higher participation of women in the scope of media. The results of GMMP 2020 in Macau indicate that even though there is no evidence of blatant discrimination of women in the media, in many occasions their voice is still not heard.

[^3]
## RECOMMENDATIONS AND ACTION PLAN 2021-2025

In line with recommendations in UNESCO's book "Setting the gender agenda for communication policy" ${ }^{10}$, media industry organizations are advised to implement workplace policies assuring gender equality not only when hiring but also placement of media professionals. Media organizations and professionals should develop guidelines to assure gender balance in news content. More research could be conducted to assess how women are portrayed in Macau media. Researches could also follow up on existing information about gender equality in management roles within media organizations. The Government could contribute with funding for academic and NGO monitoring projects.

Continuation of GMMP in Macau SAR could prove useful to register changes that might occur over the time and therefore taking a role in understanding which policy measures should be implemented for gender equality.

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

Base de Dados das Mulheres de Macau. (s.d.). Obtido em Maio de 2021, de https://www.womendb.ias.gov.mo/index
Centre of the Statistics and Census Service. (March de 2021). Demographic Statistics 2020. Macau: DSEC. Obtido de https://www.dsec.gov.mo/getAttachment/047b1912-9279-4cd3-b432-e38601e84a60/P_DEM_PUB_2020_Y.aspx
Conselho para os Assuntos das Mulheres e Crianças. (s.d.). Obtido em Maio de 2021, de https://www.camc.gov.mo/cam/pt/standard/introduction.html
Government of Macao Special Administrative Region Statistics and Census Service. (s.d.). Survey on Information Technology Usage in the Household Sector 2020. Obtido de Statistics and Census Service: https://www.dsec.gov.mo/getAttachment/0104047b-0db0-4fle-a172-6068449a9b23/E_UTI_FR_2020_Y.aspx
Instituto de Acção Social do Governo da RAEM. (s.d.). Planeamento dos "Objectivos do Desenvolvimento das Mulheres de Macau" (2019-2025) . Macau.
Instituto de Acção Social. (s.d.). Relatório sobre a Condição da Mulher em Macau 2017. Obtido de Conselho para os Assuntos das Mulheres e Crianças: https://www.camc.gov.mo/cam/wr_2017_ptg.pdf
UNESCO; Global Alliance on Media and Gender. (2019). Setting the gender agenda for communication policy: new proposals from the Global Alliance on Media and Gender. Obtido em May de 2021, de https://unesdoc.unesco.org/ark:/48223/pf0000368962.locale=en

[^4]
## Annex 1. Methodology

A key characteristic of longitudinal research is the assessment of change over time in the observed variables. In the case of the Global Media Monitoring Project (GMMP) that studies gender equality dimensions of news media content, the methods of data collection and analysis remain consistent over time in order to accurately capture change. Similar to previous years, the methodology and indicators studied have remained relatively stable to enable the historical comparisons.

## Process

The global monitoring day scheduled initially for the first quarter of 2020 was postponed to later in the year due to the upheavals caused by the first coronavirus (Covid-19) wave worldwide. As the April monitoring day approached, it became quickly clear that proceeding as planned would result in a news sample that would be almost entirely focused on coronavirus stories. A new need emerged to address the practicalities of monitoring during the lockdowns and curfews imposed to contain the spread of the virus, as the regular sitdown communal coding sessions were now out of the question for most teams. The risks to health and livelihoods, the need to find ways of coping with everyday life, would shift the GMMP down on the ladder of priorities for the volunteers, potentially increasing the dropout rate. These new challenges called for a pause on the plans to search for solutions and put in place the tools and resources necessary before monitoring could proceed.

The GMMP technical advisory group and the database development team Code for Africa worked to systematically address the issues. A new monitoring date was set for September, the coding tools were tweaked to capture Covid-19 stories without compromising on the ability to compare results across time based on story topics, exhaustive audio-visual training resources on how to code in a pandemic were put in place, electronic coding instruments were developed and the teams were re-trained in numerous webinars.

As with previous editions of the GMMP, the initial data capture was conducted offline by volunteer teams across the 116 participating countries. For the 2020 GMMP, a spreadsheet version of the coding sheets was provided, to allow for electronic recording of the observations.

In the period leading up to the monitoring day, regional and national training sessions were organised to build a uniform understanding of the teams on the methodology and approach to coding. The teams received training on media selection, newscast and article selection, the number of media to code and how to select each country's contextual information.

For the 2020 GMMP, teams could choose from two possible options for the monitoring:

- Full monitoring, whose results provide a comprehensive picture of the status of gender equality dimensions in news media.
- Short monitoring, a shorter version which focuses on the key GMMP indicators, for teams who wish to take part but might be constrained from implementing the full monitoring.

To ensure accuracy in the coding process, radio and television bulletin were recorded, and copies of digital and print media pieces were collected. Across the different media typesboth for full and short monitoring-monitors captured information about the story, its main themes and the people in the story, as journalists, as story subjects and sources.
Additionally, three optional special questions, unique to each country, allowed individual countries to analyse issues of national interest. For standardisation purposes, as well as the multilingual nature of this study, all responses were numerically coded from fixed lists.

To enable comparability of data gathered from a pandemic-heavy news agenda with the historical results, an additional question was included which asked whether the story was related to Covid-19. For such stories, monitors were requested to code the most relevant secondary topic. While global news stories had diversified to pre-pandemic levels by the global monitoring day, the regional analysis demonstrated the significance of this question, particularly for North America and the Middle East, which recorded 37\% and 36\% of Covid-19-related stories respectively.

## Media bands

The media bands system was introduced in 2005 to ensure a more even spread of data and also serve as each country's reference point on the minimum number of media to monitor. This system was retained for the 2020 GMMP and was developed with the input of the country coordinators.

## Weighting

While the GMMP seeks to understand how gender is represented in media across the world, differences in media access and impact across the participating countries mean that a simple aggregation of the data would lead to biased results. For example, if a country like France submitted data from 100 media, the entries from a smaller country like Fiji would have little, if any, impact on the results. Additionally, while two countries may have similar numbers of newspapers, their impact, in terms of the number of people who read them, may be significantly different. To address these challenges, GMMP 2020 updated, re-tested and applied the weighting system first developed for the 2005 edition.

## Accuracy

The GMMP involved several thousand people across 116 countries from diverse gender and media stakeholder groups, with different research abilities and working in a wide range of languages. For a study of this scale, it was crucial that accuracy was considered at each stage, to maintain the high levels achieved in previous years. Data entry and processing errors can have severe biasing effects on the data analysis, resulting in misrepresentation of the observed variables. To minimise this risk, we leveraged on a variety of automated processes, as well as the extensive media monitoring experience of the country coordinators.

## Limitations

As with any study, great effort was made to ensure accuracy of the data. As observed in previous GMMPs, an exact error of measurement cannot be determined due to the study's magnitude. Conventional error measurement would involve different researchers coding the same story and then calculating a level of error from the differences between the results. Although this was not possible for GMMP, we followed best practice mechanisms to
make sure that there were minimal errors in the data capture and analysis generation process.


#### Abstract

About Code for Africa Code for Africa (CfA) is the continent's largest network of indigenous African civic technology and investigative data journalism laboratories, with over 70 staff in 19 countries, who build digital democracy solutions that are intended to give citizens unfettered access to actionable information that empowers them to make informed decisions and that strengthen civic engagement for improved public governance and accountability.


## Annex 2. List of Monitors

André Vinagre<br>Catarina Pereira<br>Maria Salomé Fernandes (coordinator)<br>Pedro Arede<br>Pedro Benjamim Ribeiro<br>Rima Cui<br>Tatiana Rocha<br>Vítor Quintã<br>Viviana Chan

## WACC

WACC
308 Main Street
Toronto
ON M4C 4X7
Canada

Tel：＋1 4166911999
gmmp＠waccglobal．org
www．whomakesthenews．org
＠whomakesthenews

AIPIM
Avenida Comercial de Macau，No．70，
FIT Centre，5th Floor－A，
Macau S．A．R．
https：／／www．aipim．org．mo／


[^0]:    ${ }^{1}$ Global Media Monitoring Project, Women's participation in the news. National Watch on Images of Women in the Media (MediaWatch) Inc. 1995
    ${ }^{2}$ Gallagher, Margaret. Who makes the news? Global Media Monitoring Project, 2005. World Association for Christian Communication.

[^1]:    ${ }^{3}$ In Who makes the news? The Global Media Monitoring Project report, 2015
    ${ }^{4}$ (Conselho para os Assuntos das Mulheres e Crianças, s.d.)
    ${ }^{5}$ The development goals can be consulted in:
    http://www.cam.gov.mo/cam/Macao Women Development Goals PTG.pdf

[^2]:    ${ }^{6}$ A women database including (Government of Macao Special Administrative Region Statistics and Census Service; Centre of the Statistics and Census Service, 2021) information regarding women and media, as well as other key areas, can be found at: https://www.womendb.ias.gov.mo/index
    ${ }^{7}$ Report available in Portuguese in: https://www.camc.gov.mo/cam/wr 2017_ptg.pdf
    ${ }^{8}$ Survey results available in: https://www.dsec.gov.mo/getAttachment/0104047b-0db0-4f1e-a1726068449a9b23/E UTI FR 2020 Y.aspx

[^3]:    ${ }^{9}$ Demographic indicators show that in 2020 the total population of Macau was divided into 363.300 women and 319.800 men. Data from: https://www.dsec.gov.mo/getAttachment/047b1912-9279-4cd3-b432e38601e84a60/P DEM PUB 2020 Y.aspx

[^4]:    ${ }^{10}$ (UNESCO; Global Alliance on Media and Gender, 2019)

